VERMONT LAW SCHOOL



Environmental and Natural Resources Law Clinic Vermont Law School, PO Box 96, Chelsea Street South Royalton, VT 05068-0096 802-831-1630 (phone) • 802-831-1631 (fax)

VIA U.S. MAIL AND ELECTRONIC SUBMISSION

January 14th, 2009

Eurika Durr
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Clerk of the Board, Environmental Appeals Board (MC 1103B)
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20460-0001

Re: Upper Blackstone Water Pollution Abatement District Petitioner Conservation Law Foundation's Opposition to Upper Blackstone Water Pollution District's Motion for Leave to File a Reply Brief NPDES Appeal Nos. 08-11, 08-12, 08-13, 08-14, 08-15, 08-16, 08-17, and 08-18 NPDES Permit No. MA 0102369

Dear Ms. Durr:

In connection with the above-reference permit appeals, please find enclosed for docketing and review one original and one copy of Conservation Law Foundation's Opposition to Upper Blackstone Water Pollution District's Motion for Leave to File a Reply Brief.

If you have any questions, please call me at 802-831-1627.

David K. Mears, Esq.

Sincerely,

Enclosures

cc: Recipients listed on enclosed certificate of service

Environmental Appeals Board United States Environmental Protection Agency Washington, D.C.

In re:)
)
Upper Blackstone) S
Water Pollution Abatement District) NPDES Appeal Nos. 08-11, 08-12,
NPDES Permit No. MA 0102369) 08-13, 08-14, 08-15, 08-16, 08-17,
) and 08-18

PETITIONER CONSERVATION LAW FOUNDATION'S OPPOSITION TO UPPER BLACKSTONE WATER POLLUTION DISTRICT'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE A REPLY BRIEF

Introduction

Conservation Law Foundation ("CLF") moves the Environmental Appeals Board (the "Board") to deny the Upper Blackstone Water Pollution Abatement District's (the "District") motion for leave to reply. Alternatively, if the Board should decide to grant the District's motion, CLF moves the Board for Leave to submit a reply to Region 1's memorandum in opposition to petitions for review and to the other petitions for review of the NPDES permit issued to the District.

The rules governing petitions for review of an NPDES permit to the Board are contained in Title 40 C.F.R. pt. 124. Although the rules do not make any specific provision concerning motions for Leave to File a Reply, under Environmental Appeals Board Practice Manual Section III D(5), a petitioner may request leave to file a reply to the permitting authority's response to a petition for review prior to the EAB's decision to grant or deny review. Granting leave to reply is within the discretion of this Board.

Argument

I. The District's Motion For Leave To File A Reply Brief Should Be Denied.

The District's motion is unwarranted and should be denied based on the vagueness of its general arguments and the unlikelihood that its reply would aid the Board any further in reaching a decision in this matter. Furthermore, in light of the fact that the District already received extra time to review and respond to the petitions submitted by the other parties while preparing their supplemental petition for review, more time to file another substantive pleading is unnecessary. Therefore, the Board should deny the District's motion.

II. <u>In The Alternative, CLF Should Be Allowed Leave To File A Reply Brief.</u>

If the Board determines that a reply brief should be allowed, CLF too requests the opportunity to submit a short reply in order to correct references to the record and law, or to clarify the basis of CLF's petition in response to arguments raised in Region 1's memorandum in opposition to petitions for review and in the District's petition for review as related to the proposed nitrogen and phosphorus limits.

Conclusion

For reasons identified herein, Petitioner respectfully requests that the District's motion for leave to file a reply be denied or, in the alternative, if the District's motion is granted, that CLF be permitted to file its own reply.

Dated at South Royalton, Vermont on this 14th day of January, 2009

Respectfully Submitted,

CONSERVATION LAW FOUNDATION

By: David K. Mears

Environmental and Natural Resources Law Clinic

Vermont Law School

P.O. Box 96, Chelsea Street

South Royalton, VT 05068

(802) 831-1627

dmears@vermontlaw.edu

Christopher M. Kilian, Esq. Conservation Law Foundation 15 East State St, Suite 4 Montpelier, VT 05602

(802)-223-5992

John Davenport

Conservation Law Foundation

62 Summer Street

Boston, MA 02110-1016

Phone: (617) 350-0990

Fax: (617) 350-4030

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Motion in Opposition to Upper Blackstone Water Pollution District's Motion for Leave to File a Reply Brief in connection with NPDES Appeal Nos. 08-11, 08-12, 08-13, 08-14, 08-15, 08-16, 08-17, and 08-18 were sent to the following individuals in the manner indicated:

By First Class U.S. Mail:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Clerk of the Board, Environmental Appeals Board (MC 1103B) Ariel Rios Building 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20460-0001

Norman E. Bartlett, II, Esq. Bowditch & Dewey, LLP 175 Crossing Boulevard Framingham, MA 01702

Karen A. McGuire, Esq. U.S. EPA Region 1 1 Congress Street 1100 (CDW) Boston, MA 02114-2023

Karen L. Crocker, Counsel Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection Office of General Counsel One Winter Street Boston, MA 02108

Northern RI Chapter 737 Trout Unlimited C/O Roland C. Gauvin 2208 Mendon Road Cumberland, RI 02864

James Shuris, P.E. MBA Director of Public Works Town of Holden, Massachusetts 1196 Main Street Holden, MA 01520 J. Bradford Lange, Vice Chairman Sewer Commission Town of Millbury, Massachusetts Municipal Office Building 127 Elm Street Millbury, MA 01527

Donald G. Manseau, Chairman Cherry Valley Sewer District P.O. Box 476 Leicester, MA 01524

David M. Moore, Esq. City Solicitor, City of Worcester City Hall 455 Main Street Worchester, MA 01608

Susan B. Forcier, Esq.
Rhode Island Department of Environmental Management
Office of Legal Services
235 Promenade Street, 4th Floor
Providence, RI 02908

Dated: January 14th, 2009

David K. Mears

Environmental and Natural Resources Law Clinic Vermont Law School
P.O. Box 96, Chelsea Street
South Resolver, VT. 05068

South Royalton, VT 05068 (802) 831-1627

dmears@vermontlaw.edu

Christopher M. Kilian, Esq. Conservation Law Foundation 15 East State St, Suite 4 Montpelier, VT 05602 (802)-223-5992

John Davenport Conservation Law Foundation 62 Summer Street Boston, MA 02110-1016 Phone: (617) 350-0990

Fax: (617) 350-4030